

Welcome to TimesPeople
What's this?

TimesPeople Lets You Share and Discover the Best of NY...

7:40 PM

Get Started No, thanks

HOME PAGE TODAY'S PAPER VIDEO MOST POPULAR TIMES TOPICS

My Account Welcome, bhayden5 Log Out Help

The New York Times

Science

Search All NYTimes.com

 Go


WORLD U.S. N.Y. / REGION BUSINESS TECHNOLOGY SCIENCE HEALTH SPORTS OPINION ARTS STYLE TRAVEL JOBS REAL ESTATE AUTOS

ENVIRONMENT SPACE & COSMOS

Advertise on NYTimes.com

FINDINGS

In That Tucked Tail, Real Pangs of Regret?

By John Tierney
Published: June 1, 2009

If you own a dog, especially a dog that has anointed your favorite rug, you know that an animal is capable of apologizing. He can whimper and slouch and tuck his tail and look positively mortified — “I don’t know *what* possessed me.” But is he really feeling sorry?

[Enlarge This Image](#)



Viktor Koen

Could any animal feel true pangs of regret? Scientists once scorned this notion as silly anthropomorphism, and I used to side with the skeptics who dismissed these displays of contrition as variations of crocodile tears. Animals seemed too in-the-moment, too busy chasing the next meal, to indulge in much self-recrimination. If old animals had a song, it would be “My Way.”

Yet as new reports keep appearing — moping coyotes, rueful monkeys, tigers that cover their eyes in remorse, chimpanzees that second-guess their choices — the more I wonder if animals do indulge in a little paw-wrangling.

Your dog may not share Hamlet’s dithering melancholia, but he might have something in common with [Woody Allen](#).

The latest data comes from brain scans of monkeys trying to win a large prize of juice by guessing where it was hidden. When the monkeys picked wrongly and were shown the location of the prize, the neurons in their brain clearly registered what might have been, according to the [Duke University](#) neurobiologists who recently [reported the experiment in Science](#).

“This is the first evidence that monkeys, like people, have ‘would-have, could-have, should-have’ thoughts,” said Ben Hayden, one of the researchers. Another of the authors,

[Next Article in Science \(2 of 22\) »](#)

Get DealBook News Alerts



Sign up today to receive breaking Wall Street news.

benhayden@gmail.com [Sign Up](#)

[Change E-mail Address](#) | [Privacy Policy](#)

SIGN IN TO
RECOMMEND

E-MAIL

SEND TO PHONE

PRINT

REPRINTS

SHARE

ARTICLE TOOLS
SPONSORED BY



TierneyLab

What do animals regret? Join the discussion.

[Go to TierneyLab »](#)

Further Reading

"Fictive Reward Signals in the Anterior Cingulate Cortex." B. Hayden, J.M. Pearson, M.L. Platt. Science, 2009 (PDF)

"Nonhuman species' reactions to inequity and their implications for fairness." S.Brosnan, Journal of Social Justice, 2006. (PDF)

"Wild Justice." M. Bekoff, J. Pierce



MOST POPULAR

E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED

1. [Paul Krugman: Reagan Did It](#)
2. [The Way We Live Now: Let the Kid Be](#)
3. [Recipes for Health: Healthier Pizzas](#)
4. [Nicholas D. Kristof: Cum Laude in Evading Bandits](#)
5. [Editorial Observer: The Lord Justice Hath Ruled: Pringles Are Potato Chips](#)
6. [Put Ad on Web. Count Clicks. Revise.](#)
7. [The 31-Year-Old in Charge of Dismantling G.M.](#)
8. [Frank Rich: Who Is to Blame for the Next Attack?](#)
9. [This Land: A Town Fights to Save an Oasis of Baguettes](#)
10. [Hips Are Bringing More Athletes to Their Knees](#)

[Go to Complete List »](#)

University of Chicago Press, 2009.
 "The Parrot's Lament." E. Linden.
 Dutton, 1999.

"Are we barking up the right tree?"
 S. D. Gosling, S. Vazire. Journal of
 Research in Personality, 2003.
 (PDF)

RSS Feed

Get Science News From The
 New York Times »

Michael Platt, noted that the monkeys reacted to their losses by shifting their subsequent guesses, just like humans who respond to a missed opportunity by shifting strategy.

"I can well imagine that regret would be highly advantageous evolutionarily, so long as one doesn't obsess over it, as in depression," Dr. Platt said. "A monkey lacking in regret might act like a psychopath or a simian Don Quixote."

In earlier experiments, both chimpanzees and monkeys that traded tokens for cucumbers responded negatively once they saw that other animals were getting a tastier treat — grapes — for the same price. They made angry sounds and sometimes flung away the cucumbers or their tokens, [reported Sarah Brosnan](#), a psychologist at Georgia State University.

"I think animals do experience regret, as defined as the recognition of a missed opportunity," Dr. Brosnan said. "In the wild, these abilities may help them to recognize when they should forage in different areas or find a different cooperative partner who will share the spoils more equitably."

No one knows, of course, exactly how this sense of regret affects an animal emotionally. When we see a dog slouching and bowing, we like to assume he's suffering the way we do after a faux pas, but maybe he's just sending a useful signal: I messed up.

"It's possible that this kind of social signal in animals could have evolved without the conscious experience of regret," said [Sam Gosling](#), a psychologist at the [University of Texas](#), Austin. "But it seems more plausible that there is some kind of conscious experience even if it's not the same kind of thing that you or I feel."

Marc Bekoff, a behavioral ecologist at the [University of Colorado](#), says he's convinced that animals feel emotional pain for their mistakes and missed opportunities. In "[Wild Justice](#)," a new book he wrote with the philosopher Jessica Pierce, Dr. Bekoff reports on thousands of hours of observation of coyotes in the wild as well as free-running domesticated dogs.

When a coyote recoiled after being bitten too hard while playing, the offending coyote would promptly bow to acknowledge the mistake, Dr. Bekoff said. If a coyote was shunned for playing unfairly, he would slouch around with his ears slightly back, head cocked and tail down, tentatively approaching and then withdrawing from the other animals. Dr. Bekoff said the apologetic coyotes reminded him of the unpopular animals skulking at the perimeter of a dog park.

"These animals are not as emotionally sophisticated as humans, but they have to know what's right and wrong because it's the only way their social groups can work," he said. "Regret is essential, especially in the wild. Humans are very forgiving to their pets, but if a coyote in the wild gets a reputation as a cheater, he's ignored or ostracized, and he ends up leaving the group." Once the coyote is on his own, Dr. Bekoff discovered, the coyote's risk of dying young rises fourfold.

If our pets realize what soft touches we are, perhaps their regret is mostly just performance art to sucker us. But I like to think that some of the ruefulness is real, and that researchers will one day compile a list of the Top 10 Pet Regrets. (You can make nominations at TierneyLab, at nytimes.com/tierneylab.) At the very least, I'd like to see

ADVERTISEMENTS



Ads by Google

what's this?

[Change the World](#)

Change your career! Psychology B.A. degree w/social justice focus.
www.pgsp.edu

[Argosy University](#)

Study for your Ed.D in Counseling Psychology at Argosy University!
www.Argosy-edu.com

[Animal T-Shirts](#)

Find Animal Tees & Much More! 1000's of T-Shirts at Low Prices.
www.CafePress.com

researchers tackle a few of the great unanswered questions:

When you're playing fetch with a dog, how much regret does he suffer when he gives you back the ball? As much as when he ends the game by hanging on to the ball?

Do animal vandals feel any moral qualms? After seeing rugs, suitcases and furniture destroyed by my pets, I'm not convinced that evolution has endowed animals with any reliable sense of property rights. But I'm heartened by Eugene Linden's stories of contrite vandals in his book on animal behavior, "[The Parrot's Lament.](#)"

He tells of a young tiger that, after tearing up all the newly planted trees at a California animal park, covered his eyes with his paws when the zookeeper arrived. And there were the female chimpanzees at the Tulsa Zoo that took advantage of a renovation project to steal the painters' supplies, don gloves and paint their babies solid white. When confronted by their furious keeper, the mothers scurried away, then returned with peace offerings and paint-free babies.

How awkward is the King Kong Syndrome? Both male and female gorillas have become so fond of their human keepers that they've made sexual overtures — one even took to dragging his keeper by her hair. After the inevitable rebuff, do they regret ruining a beautiful friendship?

Do pet cats ever regret anything?

[Sign in to Recommend](#)

A version of this article appeared in print on June 2, 2009, on page D1 of the New York edition.

[Next Article in Science \(2 of 22\) »](#)



[Click here to enjoy the convenience of home delivery of The Times for 50% off.](#)

Ads by Google

[what's this?](#)

[Psychology Degrees](#)

From Walden University Online. Start Towards a Better Future!
[Degrees.WaldenU.edu](#)

[Wild Animals](#)

Find Clipart With Less Digging. A Decision Engine Makes Search Easy!
[www.Bing.com](#)

[Psychology](#)

Enhance Your Earning Potential. Study Psychology Online.
[online.argosy.edu/psychology](#)

Related Searches

[Animals](#)

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

[Psychology and Psychologists](#)

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

[Tierney, John](#)

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

[Science and Technology](#)

[Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



[N.Y. / REGION »](#)

[OPINION »](#)

[WORLD »](#)

[OPINION »](#)

[MEDIA & ADVERTISING »](#)

[MUSIC »](#)



Where One Man's Trash Is Students' Art Material



Goodbye to the Local Car Dealer



In Hong Kong, Civil Liberties Within Limits

Op-Ed: Saving the M.T.A.
 Whoever takes the helm of the M.T.A. needs the backing of all of New York's elected leaders.



A Revolution in Prime Time, but Will It Work?



Country's King Rules With Restraint